

EPA-751

David
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US
11/16/2009 11:13 AM

To William Perkins
cc
bcc

Subject Fw: Emailing: OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601.1 No Data No Science by Marlo Lewis Phd GlobalWarming.org, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11603 Not by Fire but by Ice the Next Ice Age Now, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11607.1 Sam Kazman Competitive Enterprise

Attached are the copyrighted docs submitted to the docket office since the last batch we received on Aug. 26. I'm also attaching the comment that accompanied drafts 11607.2 and 11607.1 (both of which we should probably address in volumes 3 and 4 and elsewhere). Note that as with previous batches of copyrighted docs, the numbers are draft numbers so different than the final numbers in regulations.gov.



EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-11469.pdf

May be found at regulations.gov
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

----- Forwarded by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US on 11/16/2009 11:06 AM -----

From: Akram Assem/DC/USEPA/US
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/16/2009 11:00 AM
Subject: Emailing: OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601.1 No Data No Science by Marlo Lewis Phd GlobalWarming.org, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11603 Not by Fire but by Ice the Next Ice Age Now, OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11607.1 Sam Kazman Competitive Enterprise






The message is ready to be sent with the following file or link attachments:

OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601.1 No Data No Science by Marlo Lewis Phd GlobalWarming.org
OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601
OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11603 Not by Fire but by Ice the Next Ice Age Now
OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11607.1 Sam Kazman Competitive Enterprise Institute Deconstructing Global Warming- copyright version
OAR-2009-0171-draft-11607.2 Sam Kazman, Competitive Enterprise Institute- On the determination of climate - R.S. lindzen and YS Choi

Note: To protect against computer viruses, e-mail programs may prevent sending or receiving certain types of file attachments. Check your e-mail security settings to determine how attachments are handled.

Assem Akram
USEPA Docket Center
Records Information Manager IV
ASRC Management Services-Contractor
Phone: (202) 566-9555
Email: assem.akram@epa.gov



-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601.1 No Data No Science by Marlo Lewis Phd GlobalWarming.org.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11601.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11603 Not by Fire but by Ice the Next Ice Age Now.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11607.1 Sam Kazman Competitive Enterprise Institute Deconstructing Global Warming- copyright version.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-draft-11607.2 Sam Kazman, Competitive Enterprise Institute- On the determination of climate - R.S. lindzen and YS Choi.pdf

These documents are not available on regulations.gov since they contain copyrighted material that may not be reproduced without consent of the copyright holder.

Contact the EPA Docket Center, Public Reading Room to view or receive a copy of this document. Requests for copies may be made as follows:

In person/writing:

Environmental Protection Agency, Docket Center

1301 Constitution Ave NW, 2822T, Room 3334

Washington, DC 20004

Telephone:

202-566-1744

Fax:

202-566- 9744

Email:

docket-customerservice@epa.gov



October 30, 2009

United States Environmental Protection Agency

Dear Sir or Madam:

Re: Docket ID No. EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

Attached for submission to EPA's Endangerment docket are the following new items:

- 1) the slides for a lecture delivered by Dr. Richard S. Lindzen, Alfred P. Sloan Professor of Atmospheric Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, in Washington DC this past Monday; and
- 2) a recently published article coauthored by Prof. Lindzen that was discussed in that lecture: R.S. Lindzen & Y.-S. Choi, On the Determination of Climate Feedbacks from ERBE Data, Geophysical Research Letters, v. 36, L16705, doi:10.1029/2009GL039628, 2009 (published Aug. 26, 2009).

Both the lecture and the article deal with the observation of negative climate feedback to rising temperature, precisely the opposite of the positive feedback shown by 11 IPCC AR4 atmospheric models.

In Dr. Lindzen's words, this indicates *"that the very foundation of the issue of global warming is wrong"*. (Attachment 1, slide 49).

We submit that this material, both on its own and in conjunction with materials previously filed by CEI (especially CEI's Oct. 6th Petition to Reopen on the Basis of New Evidence Concerning the Destruction of Data, and CEI's June 30th submission of the improperly concealed work of EPA Senior Operations Research Analyst Dr. Alan Carlin), demonstrate the need for EPA to re-open this docket for further public comment.

Respectfully submitted,

Sam Kazman

General Counsel

Competitive Enterprise Institute

1899 L St. NW, 12th Floor

Washington DC 20036

skazman@cei.org

202-331-2265



- Lindzen Cap. Hill lecture, 10-09.pdf



- Lindzen ERBE article 8-26-2009.pdf

May be found on [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov) under docket ID number EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

EPA-504

John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US

11/17/2009 04:18 PM

To Rona Birnbaum

cc Ben DeAngelo, Carol Holmes, Dina Kruger, Lesley Jantarasami

bcc

Subject Re: section II

Rona, here are some revisions on I and II, updating some responses, as well as revisions to V. All have been run by Carol. I put them on what I have as the OMB version, as that has all of the sections.

(b)(5) deliberative, (b)(5) ACP

Draft Endangerment Finding 110609 -jh1117 v2.doc

John Hannon
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, D.C. 20460
Phone (202) 564-5563
Fax (202) 564-5603

Rona Birnbaum [hi John, we've gone ahead and broken...](#) 11/16/2009 05:10:16 PM

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
To: John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/16/2009 05:10 PM
Subject: section II

hi John, we've gone ahead and broken the Findings down into 5 segments so that we minimize the chances of version control issues. Attached is Section II. When we're at the point of revising based on interagency review, we'll be keeping track of who holds the pen for each section. All changes should continue to be made in track changes.
thanks, Rona

[attachment "Draft Endangerment Finding Sec II 111609.doc" deleted by John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US]

Thanks,

Lesley
Rona Birnbaum
Chief, Climate Science and Impacts Branch
USEPA, Climate Change Division
birnbaum.rona@epa.gov
202-343-9076

John Hannon [Rona, There will likely be various editin...](#) 11/13/2009 04:09:57 PM

From: John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina

Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/13/2009 04:09 PM
Subject: Re: additional comment from Hunton and Williams

Rona,

There will likely be various editing throughout the preamble as we move to the final. E.g., I will be updating the response on section II to add a reference to this, and there will be revisions based on interagency, etc. etc. Is there a specific version we should work from? For example, should we be working from a document that is the entire preamble, or will the document be broken into 5 separate working documents, one for each section? Just let me know what the plans are. Thanks.

John Hannon
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, D.C. 20460
Phone (202) 564-5563
Fax (202) 564-5603

Rona Birnbaum	FYI. OMB was cc'd on this. ----- Forw...	11/13/2009 03:10:43 PM
---------------	------------------------------------------	------------------------

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
To: Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/13/2009 03:10 PM
Subject: additional comment from Hunton and Williams

FYI. OMB was cc'd on this.

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 11/13/2009 03:07 PM -----

----- Forwarded by Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US on 11/13/2009 02:44 PM -----

From: "Wood, Allison" <awood@hunton.com>
To: Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Group A-AND-R-DOCKET@EPA
Cc: (b)(6) privacy - Cass Sunstein, (b)(6) privacy - Kevin Neyland
Date: 11/13/2009 02:35 PM
Subject: Supplemental Comments for Docket No. EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

Dear Mr. Martinich,

Attached please find supplemental comments of the Utility Air Regulatory Group on EPA's Proposed Endangerment and Cause or Contribute Findings for Greenhouse Gases Under Section 202(a) of the Clean Air Act. Please contact me if you have any questions regarding these comments.

Sincerely,

Allison D. Wood, Esq.
Counsel to the Utility Air Regulatory Group

<<Final Additional Supplemental Comments on Proposed Endangerment Finding.pdf>> [attachment
"Final Additional Supplemental Comments on Proposed Endangerment Finding.pdf" deleted by John
Hannon/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-811

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/18/2009 12:10 PM

To: David Chalmers
cc
bcc
Subject: Fw: half of Vol 2 reviewed

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/18/2009 12:10 PM -----

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/13/2009 04:42 PM
Subject: Re: Fw: half of Vol 2 reviewed

Done. With one exception (eg, an insertion that (b)(5) deliberative which I deleted), I have to say that Rona's edits all make this a much better document. Also, (b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC draft Volume 2 Validity of Data.RB comments.110609.mcs.doc

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD
phone: 202-343-9993
fax: 202-343-2202
1310 L Street 256C
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow
with the EPA Climate Division

Jason Samenow [marcus-- can you please address ron...](#) 11/13/2009 12:25:10 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/13/2009 12:25 PM
Subject: Fw: half of Vol 2 reviewed

marcus-- can you please address (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy and then send back to me?

thanks,
jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/13/2009 12:24 PM -----

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/13/2009 11:42 AM
Subject: half of Vol 2 reviewed

still working on 2nd half

[attachment "RTC draft Volume 2 Validity of Data.RB comments.110609.doc" deleted by Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-754

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
Sent by: Bill Perkins

11/18/2009 01:48 PM

To Jason Samenow

cc Ben DeAngelo, David Chalmers, Jeremy Martinich, Lesley Jantarasami, Marcus Sarofim, Michael Kolian, Rona Birnbaum

bcc

Subject 1 of 3: Major comment sets for QA/QC

All,

Enclosed are the comment files for those, in 3 emails. Also on share drive at:

(b)(6) privacy

Cheers,

Bill

[Alan Carlin \(4003, from CEI-Sam Kazman\)\)](#)

[Holland and Hart \(3722\)](#)

[UARG \(3394.1\)](#)

[D'Aleo \(3187.1-5\)](#)

[Christy \(3215.1 \)](#)

[CEI -- Marlo Lewis \(3316.1 ANPRref1\) and Chris Horner \(3316.1\)](#)

[API \(3747.1\)](#)

[Chamber of Commerce \(Wolff Declaration and Fraser Institute report incorporation, 3411.2\)](#)

[Chamber of Commerce \(Kovacs et al., 3411.1\)](#)

[Monckton \(0700.1\)](#)

[Southeastern Legal Foundation \(3440.1\)](#)

[Haapala, NIPCC \(3446.1\)](#)

[Heartland Institute \(3535\)](#)

[Marshall Institute \(3291.1\)](#)

[Armstrong \(11465.1\)](#)

[American Farm Bureau Federation \(3498.1\)](#)

[BakerBotts LLP \(3509.1\)](#)

[Rick Perry- Governor of Texas \(3324.1\)](#)

[CFACT-Driessen \(3214.1 and 3214.2\)](#)

[Deseret \(3596.1\)](#)

[Michaels/Knappenburger \(3596.2\)](#)

[Idso \(3596.3\)](#)

[Fred Singer \(3330.1 \)](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3411.2.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3722.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3747.1.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-4003.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0318-1499.1.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3187.1.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3187.2.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3187.3.pdf](#)



[EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3187.4.pdf](#)

 EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3187.5.pdf  EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3215.1.pdf  EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3316.1.doc
 EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3394.1.pdf  EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-3411.1.pdf

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

May be found at [regulations.gov](http://www.regulations.gov)
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

Jason Samenow [Here were my thoughts: Alan Carlin \(4...](#) 11/10/2009 04:02:02 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/10/2009 04:02 PM
Subject: Major comment sets to potentially scrub

Here were my thoughts:

Alan Carlin (4003, from CEI-Sam Kazman))
Holland and Hart (3722)
UARG (3394.1)
D'Aleo (3187.1-5)
Christy (3215.1)
CEI -- Marlo Lewis (3316.1 ANPRref1) and Chris Horner (3316.1)
API (5058)
Chamber of Commerce (Wolff Declaration and Fraser Institute report incorporation, 3411.2)
Chamber of Commerce (Kovacs et al., 3411.1)
Monckton (0700.1)
Southeastern Legal Foundation (3440.1)
Haapala, NIPCC (3446.1)
Heartland Institute (3535)
Marshall Institute (3291.1)
Armstrong (11465.1)
American Farm Bureau Federation (3498.1)
BakerBotts LLP (3509.1)
Rick Perry- Governor of Texas (3324.1)
CFACT-Driessen (3214.1 and 3214.2)
Deseret (3596.1)
Michaels/Knappenburger (3596.2)
Idso (3596.3)
Fred Singer (3330.1)

EPA-1221

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/18/2009 08:50 PM

To Rona Birnbaum
cc Marcus Sarofim
bcc
Subject additional volume 2 comments-responses

These are new, and we can either combine with what we have or just send to Dina separately. Might be easier to do the latter.

Marcus-- (b)(5) deliberative

Jason

(b)(5) deliberative

new volume 2 comment-responses.doc

EPA-828

**Rona
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**
11/19/2009 11:33 AM

To Jason Samenow
cc
bcc
Subject Fw: Vol 2

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 11/19/2009 11:32 AM -----

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
To: Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/14/2009 09:15 AM
Subject: Vol 2

with my track changes....this is a long one.

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC draft Volume 2 Validity of Data.RB comments.110609.doc

EPA-670

**Rona
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**
11/19/2009 01:10 PM

To: Dina Kruger
cc: Suzanne Kocchi
bcc:
Subject: USE THIS ONE: Fw: Vol 2 (partially revised, and with new responses) for Dina.

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 11/19/2009 01:10 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/19/2009 12:58 PM
Subject: Vol 2 (partially revised, and with new responses) for Dina.

Rona--

This is the latest version of Vol 2. [REDACTED] (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy

Please pass along to Dina...

Thanks

Jason

(b)(5) deliberative
[REDACTED]

RTC volume 2 111909.doc

EPA-736

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US

Sent by: Bill Perkins

11/21/2009 06:45 PM

To: Rona Birnbaum

cc

bcc

Subject: fyi -- new comment excerpts

Rona,

If you wanted to look at them, I threw them all in this email for you to look at. I also included the full pdfs for you of the 4 new Group B/C comments received of late (you may have already seen a couple of these). Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

 EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-11493.pdf  EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-11469.1.pdf  EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-11469.pdf

 EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-11492.pdf  Comment Code 14 Extensions and Reopenings.doc

 Comment Code 9.6.2.3 Greenhouse Gas Effect Does Not Exist.doc

 Comment Code 3.1 General Comments on the Legal Basis of the Proposed Findings.doc  Comment Code 3.2 Statutory Basis.doc

 Comment Code 3.3 Massachusetts vs. EPA.doc

 Comment Code 4.1 General Comments on Technical Considerations for the Findings.doc

 Comment Code 4.5 Consideration of Net Effects (harm vs. benefits).doc  Comment Code 4.5.1 Cost-Benefits Considerations.doc

 Comment Code 5.2.2.1 Carbon Dioxide.doc  Comment Code 5.2.3.1 Black Carbon.doc















 Comment Code 6.2 Scope of Emission Sources Covered.doc  Comment Code 7.1 General Comments on Impacts of the Findings.doc

 Comment Code 7.2 Mobile Sources under 202.doc  Comment Code 7.3 Air Permit Regulations.doc  Comment Code 7.5 Economy.doc

 Comment Code 8 Other Options for Regulating GG.doc  Comment Code 9.1 General Comments on the TSD_Supporting Data.doc

 Comment Code 9.2.1 Use of non-EPA assessments.doc  Comment Code 9.3 Adherence to the Data Quality Act.doc

 Comment Code 9.4 Consideration of Role of Adaptation & Mitigation.doc  Comment Code 9.5 Validity of Observed_Measured Data.doc

 
Comment Code 9.5.1 Greenhouse gas emissions and concentrations.doc Comment Code 9.5.2 Temperature.doc
 
Comment Code 9.5.6 Cryosphere.doc Comment Code 9.6.1 Agree_Disagree with TSD Conclusion.doc
 
Comment Code 9.6.2 Alternative Explanations of Observed Changes.doc Comment Code 9.6.2.2 Solar Irradiance.doc

Comment Code 9.6.2.4 Natural variability is a sufficient explanation.doc
 
Comment Code 9.6.2.5 CO2 not the cause of past global warming episodes.doc Comment Code 9.7 Validity of Future Projections.doc
  
Comment Code 9.7.1 Models.doc Comment Code 9.7.9 Air Quality Effects.doc Comment Code 9.7.11 Forestry.doc
 
Comment Code 9.7.12 Water Resources.doc Comment Code 10.1 Environmental Justice Considerations.doc

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

May be found at [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov)
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

EPA-760

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
Sent by: Bill Perkins

11/22/2009 07:17 PM

To: Rona Birnbaum

cc

bcc

Subject: fyi -- all the new comment excerpts I am sending out to the team



Comment Code 10.1 Environmental Justice Considerations.doc



Comment Code 3.1 General Comments on the Legal Basis of the Proposed Findings.doc



Comment Code 3.2 Statutory Basis.doc



Comment Code 3.3 Massachusetts vs. EPA.doc



Comment Code 4.2 Mitigation Potential.doc



Comment Code 4.5 Consideration of Net Effects (harm vs. benefits).doc



Comment Code 4.5.1 Cost-Benefits Considerations.doc



Comment Code 5.2.1 General Comments on Proposed Definition of Air Pollution.doc



Comment Code 5.2.2.1 Carbon Dioxide.doc



Comment Code 5.2.3 Additional Substances.doc



Comment Code 6.2 Scope of Emission Sources Covered.doc



Comment Code 6.3 Aggregate vs. Individual Definition of Air Pollutant.doc



Comment Code 6.3.2 Methane.doc



Comment Code 7.1 General Comments on Impacts of the Findings.doc



Comment Code 7.3 Air Permit Regulations.doc



Comment Code 7.5 Economy.doc



Comment Code 8 Other Options for Regulating GG.doc



Comment Code 9.2 IPCC and CCSP Reports as the Scientific Basis.doc



Comment Code 9.5 Validity of Observed_Measured Data.doc



Comment Code 9.5.1.1 Radiative Forcing.doc



Comment Code 9.5.2 Temperature.doc



Comment Code 9.5.5 Sea Level_Oceans.doc



Comment Code 9.6.1 Agree_Disagree with TSD Conclusion.doc



Comment Code 9.6.2 Alternative Explanations of Observed Changes.doc



Comment Code 9.6.2.1 Other Substances with Radiative Forcing Effects.doc



Comment Code 9.6.2.2 Solar Irradiance.doc



Comment Code 9.6.2.5 CO2 not the cause of past global warming episodes.doc



Comment Code 9.7.1 Models.doc



Comment Code 9.7.8 Human Health.doc



Comment Code 9.7.10 Agricultural Impacts.doc

May be found at [regulations.gov](http://www.regulations.gov)
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

EPA-1282

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/23/2009 09:37 AM

To: Marcus Sarofim
cc
bcc
Subject: Fw: Volumes 2 and 6

Marcus,

I think I'd recommend working from the tracked changes version... and then (b)(5) deliberative

Thanks for working on this.... I'll let you know when I'm freed up, but appreciate you going through as much of this as you can in the mean time.

Jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/23/2009 09:35 AM -----

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/23/2009 08:20 AM
Subject: Fw: Volumes 2 and 6

attached are Dina's comments on Vol 2.
Lesley, please forward Vol 6 to OGC for review.
thanks

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 11/23/2009 08:19 AM -----

From: Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/23/2009 08:17 AM
Subject: Volumes 2 and 6

I've done my changes on Volume 2 (b)(5) deliberative but I think that the responses should be straightforward and it will be fine. I'm attaching it in both clean and track change. People need the track change, but it may be easier to see what's going on looking at a clean version.

On Volume 6, I reviewed it and it can go to John. (b)(5) deliberative

I'm still plowing through the HighGWP preamble, which is my next priority. I've got questions, but it is well-written and looks pretty solid (I'm about 40 pages in). I also need to look at the O&G RIA. I pushed the HighGWP package to the head of the line for obvious reasons.

It was a long weekend for everyone, but I am feeling better this morning than I did on Friday. We're definitely making progress.

Dina

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 111909 + DINA.doc

Dina Kruger
Director, Climate Change Division
USEPA

202-343-9039 (phone)
202-343-2290 (fax)

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 111909 + DINA - CLEAN.doc

EPA-904

Rona
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US
11/23/2009 09:53 AM

To Michael Kolian, David Chalmers, William Perkins, Jeremy
Martinich
cc Lesley Jantarasami
bcc
Subject learning from Vol 2 comments

Dina's comments on Vol 2 has insights that are very valuable for Vol 6, 7 (revisions in progress) and possibly 4 and 8 revisions moving forward.

(b)(5) deliberative
[REDACTED]

RTC volume 2 111909 + DINA.doc

EPA-732

David
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US
11/23/2009 05:37 PM

To Jason Samenow
cc Ben DeAngelo, Jeremy Martinich, Lesley Jantarasami,
Marcus Sarofim, Michael Kolian, Rona Birnbaum, William
Perkins
bcc
Subject Re: Fw: Major comment sets to potentially scrub--ONE
MORE

The attached comment from CEI (2898.1) should be included in our scrubs. (b)(5) deliberative

I'll include the file in the folder Bill created on the share drive to house all these:
(b)(6) privacy



EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171-2898.1.pdf

May be found at regulations.gov
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

David Chalmers
ORISE Fellow
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division
202.343.9814

Jason Samenow FYI-- I printed Idso...all 1200+ pages. ... 11/10/2009 07:07:45 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus
Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/10/2009 07:07 PM
Subject: Fw: Major comment sets to potentially scrub

FYI-- I printed Idso...all 1200+ pages. Let me know if you want/need to borrow it at any point.

Jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/10/2009 07:07 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus
Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/10/2009 04:29 PM
Subject: Fw: Major comment sets to potentially scrub

minor note-- the actual comment # for the API comment set is 3747.1

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/10/2009 04:28 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/10/2009 04:02 PM
Subject: Major comment sets to potentially scrub

Here were my thoughts:

Alan Carlin (4003, from CEI-Sam Kazman))
Holland and Hart (3722)
UARG (3394.1)
D'Aleo (3187.1-5)
Christy (3215.1)
CEI -- Marlo Lewis (3316.1 ANPRref1) and Chris Horner (3316.1)
API (5058)
Chamber of Commerce (Wolff Declaration and Fraser Institute report incorporation, 3411.2)
Chamber of Commerce (Kovacs et al., 3411.1)
Monckton (0700.1)
Southeastern Legal Foundation (3440.1)
Haapala, NIPCC (3446.1)
Heartland Institute (3535)
Marshall Institute (3291.1)
Armstrong (11465.1)
American Farm Bureau Federation (3498.1)
BakerBotts LLP (3509.1)
Rick Perry- Governor of Texas (3324.1)
CFACT-Driessen (3214.1 and 3214.2)
Deseret (3596.1)
Michaels/Knappenburger (3596.2)
Idso (3596.3)
Fred Singer (3330.1)

EPA-516

Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US

11/24/2009 05:38 PM

To William Perkins

cc John Hannon, Suzanne Kocchi, Carol Holmes, Rona
Birnbaum, Dina Kruger

bcc

Subject Re: Fw: Timing of FR formatting for finding

Bill, please send this version to ERG for FR formatting plus the editorial items identified by me and Carol below.

This version contains track changes made by John and Carol on the version that was sent to OMB 11/6. If we could have the FR-formatted version by Friday that would be great. Thanks!

-Ben

(b)(5) deliberative

Draft Endangerment Finding 112409 -JH CH.doc

Carol Holmes

Other things I noticed italicize cases, ve...

11/24/2009 01:49:12 PM

From: Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/24/2009 01:49 PM
Subject: Re: Fw: Timing of FR formatting for finding

Other things I noticed

italicize cases, versus underlining them or regular type
when xreferencing other sections of the preamble, use Roman Numerals for Sections (e.g., III.B instead 3.B)
make sure an acronym etc is defined/spell-out first time it is used

Confidential communication for internal deliberations only; Attorney-client, attorney work product and/or enforcement privilege; Do not distribute outside EPA or DOJ

Carol S. Holmes
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone (202) 564-8709
Fax (202) 564-5603

Ben DeAngelo

John, Carol, Heidi let us know that whe...

11/24/2009 01:40:01 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US
To: John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/24/2009 01:40 PM
Subject: Fw: Timing of FR formatting for finding

John, Carol,

Heidi let us know that when we get comments tomorrow on the Findings they will be in a stand alone word document and not as track changes. So we thought it best to send the 'current version' to our contractor now to get into FR formatting and to address any other minor editorial issues.

So one, am assuming we should send them the version which now has track changes in them from you two (most are in sec V); these are track changes on the version sent to OMB.

And second, are there editorial things you want the contractor to look for to standardize. Am thinking at least...

- ** spell out "greenhouse gas" everywhere.
- ** "U.S." not United States
- ** "well-mixed greenhouse gases" with hyphen
- ** flag missing references
- ** "section 202(a)" small "s"

----- Forwarded by Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US on 11/24/2009 01:31 PM -----

From: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
To: Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/24/2009 01:18 PM
Subject: Re: Timing of FR formatting for finding

Suzie: Thank you.

Ben: Once I receive the file I can send it up for execution. If you have any formatting changes needed in addition to the standard FR stuff, please send me a list or we can have a quick call with the ERG team handling this task. Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

Suzanne Kocchi As soon as Ben says ok, it should go. ... 11/24/2009 01:16:30 PM

From: Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/24/2009 01:16 PM
Subject: Re: Timing of FR formatting for finding

As soon as Ben says ok, it should go. It should go today so we can get to OGC by Fri.

William Perkins

Ben and Suzie, Do we have any visibilit...

11/24/2009 01:14:25 PM

From: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/24/2009 01:14 PM
Subject: Timing of FR formatting for finding

Ben and Suzie,

Do we have any visibility on when we will want to send this to ERG based upon OMB? Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

EPA-747














David
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US
11/25/2009 10:41 AM

To Jason Samenow
cc Marcus Sarofim, William Perkins
bcc
Subject New comments for Vol. 2

Jason:

The papers from the recent Holland & Hart submission that are relevant to Vol. 2 are attached, along with the comment. We don't have a comment # for this submission yet but I'll send it out to the team as soon as I have it.

Bill: These are all already in the docket since they were submitted in hard copy and electronically but am ccing you in case they need to go in the ERG database for tracking purposes.

 Beck 2007.pdf  Seager et al 2009.pdf  Loehle 2009.pdf  Changnon 2009.pdf  Chen et al 2009.pdf  Dlugokencky 2009.pdf
 Essenhigh 2009.pdf  Knorr 2009.pdf  Le Mouel et al 2008.pdf  Sheffield et al 2009.pdf  Tedesco and Monaghan 2009.pdf
 Willis et al 2009.pdf
 Coalition 11-20-2009 Addendum & Supplementation.pdf

May be found at [regulations.gov](http://www.regulations.gov)
Docket ID # EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

David Chalmers
ORISE Fellow
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division
202.343.9814

EPA-963

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/28/2009 01:17 PM

To: Jeremy Martinich
cc
bcc
Subject: Fw: volume 2

Jeremy-- Can you please make tracked changes to your sections of volume 2 (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy based on dina's comments by, say 6 pm today? We gotta get to OGC and ERG.

Thanks,
Jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/28/2009 01:15 PM -----

From: Marcus Sarofim (b)(6) privacy
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/27/2009 09:10 AM
Subject: volume 2

(b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 112509+DINA+mcs.doc Volume2References.doc

EPA-973

Jeremy
Martinich/DC/USEPA/US
11/28/2009 06:01 PM

To Jason Samenow
cc
bcc
Subject Re: Fw: volume 2

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 112509+DINA+mcs + JM.doc

Jeremy Martinich
USEPA, Climate Change Division
202-343-9871

Jason Samenow Jeremy-- Can you please make tracke... 11/28/2009 01:17:05 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/28/2009 01:17 PM
Subject: Fw: volume 2

Jeremy-- Can you please make tracked changes to your sections of volume 2 (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy based on dina's comments by, say 6 pm today? We gotta get to OGC and ERG.

Thanks,
Jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/28/2009 01:15 PM -----

From: Marcus Sarofim (b)(6) privacy
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/27/2009 09:10 AM
Subject: volume 2

[attachment "RTC volume 2 112509+DINA+mcs.doc" deleted by Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US] [attachment "Volume2References.doc" deleted by Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-833

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/28/2009 08:22 PM

To Ben DeAngelo, Suzanne Kocchi
cc Rona Birnbaum
bcc
Subject Fw: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Ben and Suzi, FYI....

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/28/2009 08:22 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/28/2009 08:21 PM
Subject: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Team--

Here is the latest and greatest version of Vol 2, ready for review. It's another long one, nearly 70 pages (not including citations).

A few notes...

OGC-- Please pay particular attention to (b)(5) deliberative

Bill-- Recommend that ERG, in addition to copy editing this, do a reference scrub. I have a feeling we don't have a lot of the full citations in our list...so if they can help us identify those and put as many in as they can figure out, that will be really helpful (may be a long/tedious job). For citations they are not sure about, they should leave blank and flag for us to put in. And they should remember (b)(5) deliberative. Also, please remind them not to include comment numbers yet.

Lesley-- There are a few comments from Dina on your responses that I forgot to send to you. Can you please address those?

Thanks to Marcus and Jeremy for their help in responding to the last round of edits.

Jason

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 112809.doc
(b)(5) deliberative

Volume 2 References v2.doc

EPA-730

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
Sent by: Bill Perkins

11/28/2009 08:51 PM

To matthew.mitchell, sue.eisenfeld
cc mae.thomas, Lesley Jantarasami
bcc Jason Samenow
Subject Fw: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Matt and Sue,

Here is Volume 2. Please note Jason's instructions below re: not putting in comment numbers and helping us with the reference list (attached in a separate file). Thank you and please contact me or Lesley if you have any questions.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

-----Forwarded by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US on 11/28/2009 08:46PM -----

Here is the latest and greatest version of Vol 2, ready for review. It's another long one, nearly 70 pages (not including citations).

Bill-- Recommend that ERG, in addition to copy editing this, do a reference scrub. I have a feeling we don't have a lot of the full citations in our list...so if they can help us identify those and put as many in as they can figure out, that will be really helpful (may be a long/tedious job). For citations they are not sure about, they should leave blank and flag for us to put in. And they should remember (b)(5) deliberative [REDACTED] Also, please remind them not to include comment numbers yet.

Jason

(b)(5) deliberative [REDACTED]

(b)(5) deliberative [REDACTED]

- RTC volume 2 112809.doc [REDACTED] Volume 2 References v2.doc

EPA-728

William
Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
Sent by: Bill Perkins

To: David Chalmers

cc

bcc

11/29/2009 06:43 PM

Subject: Fw: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Fyi, Carol is asking about (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy sir.

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

----- Forwarded by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US on 11/29/2009 06:42 PM -----

From: Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/29/2009 06:40 PM
Subject: Re: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Here are my comments on v2. Again, overall quite good, but a few places we could be clearer, and/or the comment may be misplaced (e.g., (b)(5) deliberative). I do suggest looking at the comments/responses on (b)(5) deliberative

[REDACTED]

Also, as I mentioned before, just want to be sure that (b)(5) deliberative

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

THANKS

PS -- when can I expect (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 112809 csh 11 29.doc

Confidential communication for internal deliberations only; Attorney-client, attorney work product and/or enforcement privilege; Do not distribute outside EPA or DOJ

Carol S. Holmes
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone (202) 564-8709
Fax (202) 564-5603

Jason Samenow [Team-- Here is the latest and greatest...](#) 11/28/2009 08:22:03 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/28/2009 08:22 PM
Subject: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Team--

Here is the latest and greatest version of Vol 2, ready for review. It's another long one, nearly 70 pages (not including citations).

A few notes...

OGC-- Please pay particular attention to the (b)(5) deliberative

Bill-- Recommend that ERG, in addition to copy editing this, do a reference scrub. I have a feeling we don't have a lot of the full citations in our list...so if they can help us identify those and put as many in as they can figure out, that will be really helpful (may be a long/tedious job). For citations they are not sure about, they should leave blank and flag for us to put in. And they should remember (b)(5) deliberative. Also, please remind them not to include comment numbers yet.

Lesley-- There are a few comments from Dina on your responses that I forgot to send to you (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(5) privacy. Can you please address those?

Thanks to Marcus and Jeremy for their help in responding to the last round of edits.

Jason

[attachment "RTC volume 2 112809.doc" deleted by Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US]
[attachment "Volume 2 References v2.doc" deleted by Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-1351

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
11/30/2009 04:25 PM

To Marcus Sarofim, Jeremy Martinich
cc
bcc
Subject Fw: volume 2 back from ERG

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 11/30/2009 04:24 PM -----

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/30/2009 12:05 PM
Subject: volume 2 back from ERG

Jason,

Vol 2 is back from ERG - see below.

----- Forwarded by Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US on 11/30/2009 12:04 PM -----

From: "Matthew Mitchell" <Matthew.Mitchell@erg.com>
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Sue Eisenfeld" <Sue.Eisenfeld@erg.com>
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>
Date: 11/30/2009 12:02 PM
Subject: volume 2

Hi Bill and Lesley--

Here's the edited Volume 2. The separate reference list is coming soon--Mae and her staff have found a number of the missing entries. (I'm not sure how fruitful future searching on our part will be, since at this point I believe we're down to identifying possibilities rather than saying "This is definitely the reference being cited here.")

Oh, also, I'm afraid there's another global fix to be made to the foreword: "principle" should be "principal" in the last paragraph, second sentence. I've fixed this in Volume 2 and we'll fix it going forward.

>>> <Perkins.William@epamail.epa.gov> 11/30/2009 9:40 AM >>>

Sue and Matt,

We now anticipate for 1st-round review:

Volume	Date to ERG
4	12/1
5	11/30
6	12/1 or 12/2
9	12/1 or 12/2

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 113009 mm jt.doc

EPA-1304

Marcus
Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US
12/01/2009 11:57 AM

To: David Chalmers
cc
bcc
Subject: Fw: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD
phone: 202-343-9993
fax: 202-343-2202
1310 L Street 256C
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow
with the EPA Climate Division

----- Forwarded by Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US on 12/01/2009 11:57 AM -----

From: Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/29/2009 06:40 PM
Subject: Re: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Here are my comments on v2. Again, overall quite good, but a few places we could be clearer, and/or the comment may be misplaced (e.g., (b)(5) deliberative). I do suggest looking at the comments/responses on (b)(5) deliberative

Also, as I mentioned before, just want to be sure that (b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

THANKS

PS -- when can I expect (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) P

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 112809 csh 11 29.doc

Confidential communication for internal deliberations only; Attorney-client, attorney work product and/or enforcement privilege; Do not distribute outside EPA or DOJ

Carol S. Holmes
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone (202) 564-8709
Fax (202) 564-5603

Jason Samenow

Team-- Here is the latest and greatest...

11/28/2009 08:22:03 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina Kruger/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 11/28/2009 08:22 PM
Subject: Vol 2 for review and copy editing

Team--

Here is the latest and greatest version of Vol 2, ready for review. It's another long one, nearly 70 pages (not including citations).

A few notes...

OGC-- Please pay particular attention to the (b)(5) deliberative

Bill-- Recommend that ERG, in addition to copy editing this, do a reference scrub. I have a feeling we don't have a lot of the full citations in our list...so if they can help us identify those and put as many in as they can figure out, that will be really helpful (may be a long/tedious job). For citations they are not sure about, they should leave blank and flag for us to put in. And they should remember (b)(5) deliberative. Also, please remind them not to include comment numbers yet.

Lesley-- There are a few comments from Dina on your responses that I forgot to send to you (b)(5) deliberative. Can you please address those?

Thanks to Marcus and Jeremy for their help in responding to the last round of edits.

Jason

[attachment "RTC volume 2 112809.doc" deleted by Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US]
[attachment "Volume 2 References v2.doc" deleted by Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-810

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/01/2009 11:58 PM

To Jason Samenow
cc
bcc

Subject latest vol 2

(b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

volume 2 references_120109.doc RTC volume 2 120109.doc

EPA-803

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/03/2009 11:36 AM

To Michael Kolian
cc David Chalmers
bcc
Subject Re: vol 2 and 4

here's volume 2 -- i assume you need to review for (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy ???

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc

Michael Kolian Can you send me the most recent versi... 12/03/2009 11:23:07 AM

From: Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 12/03/2009 11:23 AM
Subject: vol 2 and 4

Can you send me the most recent versions of these? I need to look in particular, at the sections on (b)(5) deliberative, (b)(6) privacy .

Cheers,
Mike

EPA-307

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/03/2009 06:53 PM

To Carol Holmes
cc
bcc
Subject vol 2

the relevant responses span pages 32-35

thanks!

jason

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc

EPA-345

Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US

12/03/2009 07:57 PM

To Jason Samenow

cc

bcc

Subject Re: vol 2

added some language for you.

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209 csh insert added.doc

Confidential communication for internal deliberations only; Attorney-client, attorney work product and/or enforcement privilege; Do not distribute outside EPA or DOJ

Carol S. Holmes
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW (MC 2344A)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone (202) 564-8709
Fax (202) 564-5603

Jason Samenow

[the relevant responses span pages 32...](#)

12/03/2009 06:53:04 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 12/03/2009 06:53 PM
Subject: vol 2

the relevant responses span pages 32-35

thanks!

jason

[attachment "RTC volume 2 120209.doc" deleted by Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-788

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/04/2009 01:38 AM

To Jason Samenow
cc
bcc

Subject vol 2 files

(b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc volume 2 references_120209.doc

EPA-1300

Marcus
Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US
12/04/2009 02:11 PM

To Jason Samenow
cc
bcc
Subject volume 2

Hi Jason,

Here's Volume 2, with 2.1 updated based on ERG + OGC comments, and a little of QA/QC.

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 113009 mm jt-mcs.doc

Plus, new reference:

CCSP, (2007). *The First State of the Carbon Cycle Report (SOCCR): The North American Carbon Budget and Implications for the Global Carbon Cycle*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research [King, A.W., L. Dilling, G.P. Zimmerman, D.M. Fairman, R.A. Houghton, G. Marland, A.Z. Rose, and T.J. Wilbanks (eds.)]. National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center, Asheville, NC, USA, 242 pp.

-Marcus

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD
phone: 202-343-9993
fax: 202-343-2202
1310 L Street 256C
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow
with the EPA Climate Division

EPA-877

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/04/2009 04:08 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami, Marcus Sarofim, Jeremy Martinich
cc
bcc
Subject Fw: volume 2 latest, for copy editing

If you all could briefly scan these to make sure your stuff got in ok, would be appreciated.

thanks,
jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 12/04/2009 04:07 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 12/04/2009 04:06 PM
Subject: volume 2 latest, for copy editing

Bill,

Vol 2 is ready for another ERG copy edit.

Some notes:

- 1) I'd go ahead and add comment numbers.
- 2) There are a few references in comment bubbles that should be added to the separate reference list (attached)
- 3) I have not yet addressed the reference issues which ERG raised on the initial copy edit. Will need to do that later
- 4) Because the reference list is so long, it's easiest to keep it in a separate document for now. We can merge it with the Volume when we're finishing this up.

Thanks,
Jason

(b)(5) del berative

(b)(5) del berative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc volume 2 references_120209.doc

EPA-555

Jason
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
12/04/2009 04:08 PM

To Dina Kruger
cc Suzanne Kocchi, Rona Birnbaum
bcc
Subject Latest * VOLUME 2 *

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc

EPA-735

William
Perkins/DC/USEPA/US
Sent by: Bill Perkins

12/04/2009 05:01 PM

To Mae Thomas, Sue Eisenfeld, Matthew Mitchell

cc Lesley Jantarasami

bcc

Subject Fw: volume 2 latest, for copy editing

Sue and Matt,

Please see enclosed; Jason's special instructions are below. Thank you and please let us know if you have any questions.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst
Climate Science and Impacts Branch
Climate Change Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
perkins.william@epa.gov
(O) 202.343.9460
(F) 202.343.2202
(C) (b)(6) privacy

----- Forwarded by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US on 12/04/2009 05:00 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 12/04/2009 04:06 PM
Subject: volume 2 latest, for copy editing

Bill,

Vol 2 is ready for another ERG copy edit.

Some notes:

- 1) I'd go ahead and add comment numbers.
- 2) There are a few references in comment bubbles that should be added to the separate reference list (attached)
- 3) I have not yet addressed the reference issues which ERG raised on the initial copy edit. Will need to do that later
- 4) Because the reference list is so long, it's easiest to keep it in a separate document for now. We can merge it with the Volume when we're finishing this up.

Thanks,
Jason

(b)(5) deliberative

(b)(5) deliberative

RTC volume 2 120209.doc volume 2 references_120209.doc